

## **PRESENTERS**

### **The Hon Justice Paul Heath, High Court Auckland**

Justice Paul Heath graduated from Auckland University in 1978 with an LLB and practised with the Hamilton firm of Stace Hammond Grace & Partners from 1981 to 1998. In June 1998, he was appointed a Queen's Counsel. Between 1997 and 2002, he was a consultant, and later a Commissioner, of the New Zealand Law Commission. During his time at the Law Commission he was party to its reports on adoption and battered defendants. He was sworn in as a judge of the High Court in April 2002. Justice Heath is based in Auckland. From 2003 he has also sat occasionally in Divisional Courts of the Court of Appeal.

### **Simon Jefferson, Trinity Chambers, Auckland**

With almost 30 years experience specialising in family law, Simon is highly regarded throughout New Zealand for his legal skills and abilities both in and out of the courtroom. Appointed a Fellow of the International Academy of Matrimonial Lawyers in 2005, he was also an Executive Member of the Family Law Section of the NZLS from 2001 to 2006 and has presented a number of NZLS CLE seminars and chaired the NZLS CLE Family Law Conferences in 2004 and 2006. Between 2001 and 2005 he led the faculty created by the NZLS to train lawyers for appointment as legal representatives of children in the Family Court. In 1989 he was admitted to the Roll of Solicitors in the United Kingdom.

## **Acknowledgment**

Both Justice Heath and Simon Jefferson thank Daniel Pannett and Clive Lansink, Judges' Clerks, High Court, Auckland for their valuable research assistance in the preparation of these papers. Special thanks also to Prof Mark Henaghan, Emma Parsons, Ben Jefferson, Zandra Wackenier, Kevin Muir and Tania Sheehan for their assistance.

The section "Fresh evidence on appeal" is sourced from *Brookers Family Law - Family Procedure*, chapter 4. The authors wish to acknowledge and thank the publishers Thomson Brookers.

*The statements and conclusions contained in this booklet are those of the author(s) only and not those of the New Zealand Law Society. This booklet has been prepared for the purpose of a Continuing Legal Education course. It is not intended to be a comprehensive statement of the law or practice, and should not be relied upon as such. If advice on the law is required, it should be sought on a formal, professional basis.*

# CONTENTS

<b>1. APPELLATE ADVOCACY.....</b>	<b>1</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	1
THE “FISHER” PRECEPTS .....	2
AN APPEAL TO THE HIGH COURT .....	2
SOME ADDITIONAL ISSUES .....	4
<b>2. THE ROLE OF AN APPELLATE COURT.....</b>	<b>7</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	7
ERROR CORRECTION .....	7
DEVELOPMENT OF THE LAW .....	9
<b>3. APPEALS FROM THE FAMILY COURT .....</b>	<b>13</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	13
SHOULD I APPEAL? .....	15
WHAT CAN BE APPEALED AGAINST? .....	16
APPEAL OR REHEARING / APPLICATION FOR VARIATION? .....	17
JUDICIAL REVIEW .....	20
NATURE OF APPEAL – A REHEARING .....	20
STATUTORY RIGHTS OF APPEAL .....	20
INTERIM / INTERLOCUTORY ORDERS .....	24
PROCEDURE .....	25
(a) <i>Notice of Appeal – contents</i> .....	25
(b) <i>Notice of Appeal – filing and service</i> .....	26
(c) <i>Time limits</i> .....	26
(d) <i>Service</i> .....	27
(e) <i>Cross-appeal</i> .....	27
(f) <i>Initial case management conference</i> .....	27
(g) <i>Security for costs</i> .....	27
(h) <i>Fees</i> .....	28
WHEN IS AN APPEAL BROUGHT? .....	28
STAY OF PROCEEDINGS .....	28
THE INITIAL CASE MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE .....	29
ISSUES ON APPEAL .....	29
CLARIFICATION OF THE DECISION .....	30
THE COMMON BUNDLE .....	30
THE CHILD AS APPELLANT .....	31
FRESH EVIDENCE ON APPEAL .....	31
INTERLOCUTORY ORDERS .....	34
LODESTAR – THE APPELLATE APPROACH .....	34
WRITTEN SUBMISSIONS .....	37
ORAL ARGUMENT .....	38
ETIQUETTE .....	39
OUTCOMES .....	41
ABANDONMENT OF APPEAL .....	41
COSTS .....	41
<b>4. BEYOND THE HIGH COURT .....</b>	<b>43</b>
THE SUPREME COURT .....	49
THE CASES .....	50
ANALYSIS .....	54
<b>APPENDIX A.....</b>	<b>57</b>
O’CONNOR V COLE, JUDGMENT OF JUDGE MATTHEWS .....	59
COLE V O’CONNOR, SUBMISSIONS OF APPELLANT .....	73
COLE V O’CONNOR, SUBMISSIONS OF RESPONDENT .....	83
SCOTT V WINDSOR, DAVIDSON AND PENROSE, JUDGMENT OF JUDGE G COWPER .....	93

WINDSOR, DAVIDSON AND PENROSE V SCOTT, SUBMISSIONS OF APPELLANT .....	119
WINDSOR, DAVIDSON AND PENROSE V SCOTT, SUBMISSIONS OF RESPONDENT .....	129
<b>APPENDIX B: PRECEDENTS .....</b>	<b>137</b>
NOTICE OF MOTION ON APPEAL .....	139
NOTICE OF APPEAL .....	143
NOTICE OF MOTION ON APPEAL .....	147
APPLICATION FOR STAY OF EXECUTION OF JUDGMENT PENDING APPEAL .....	151
WITHOUT NOTICE APPLICATION FOR STAY OF JUDGMENT .....	155
WITHOUT NOTICE APPLICATION FOR ORDER GRANTING LEAVE TO APPEAL INTERIM ORDER GRANTING PARENTING ORDER AND THE REFUSAL TO RESCIND THAT ORDER.....	159
ON NOTICE INTERLOCUTORY APPLICATION FOR EXTENSION OF TIME FOR BRINGING APPEAL .....	163
APPLICATION TO ADDUCE FURTHER EVIDENCE .....	167
JOINT MEMORANDUM OF COUNSEL FOR PURPOSE OF APPEALS CONFERENCE .....	169
JOINT MEMORANDUM OF COUNSEL FOR CASE MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE.....	173
NOTICE OF INTERLOCUTORY APPLICATION FOR LEAVE TO APPEAL TO THE COURT OF APPEAL.....	177
NOTICE OF MOTION ON APPEAL TO COURT OF APPEAL ON A QUESTION OF LAW .....	181
<b>APPENDIX C: ARTICLE – THE ROLE OF AN APPELLATE JUDGE .....</b>	<b>183</b>